BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 03320 3258

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

VOLUME II

Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991-92

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

THESE MATERIALS ARE DISTRIBUTED SOLELY FOR CLASSROOM USE BY STUDENTS IN THE FACULTY OF LAW, UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 23 1991
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

VOLUME II

Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991-92

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

THESE MATERIALS ARE DISTRIBUTED SOLELY FOR CLASSROOM USE BY STUDENTS IN THE FACULTY OF LAW, UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma02roge_5

FAMILY LAW

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME II

PAGE #

V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

A. Historical Overview

a) Common Law

OLRC, Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property 443

b) Trust Doctrine

LRCC, Family Property 446
Note: Murdoch v. Murdoch 448
Rathwell v. Rathwell 449
Pettkus v. Becker 459
Globe and Mail, "Woman's Suicide Ends Fight for Rights" 471
Sorochan v. Sorochan 472
Note: Recent Decisions on Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trust 479
Kutt v. Sam 481

c) Statutory Reform

Holland, "Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario" 485
Wolfson, The New Family Law Act 487

B. The F.L.A.

a) The Partnership Principle

Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules" 493
Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law" 502
Eekelaar, Family Law and Social Policy "Adjustment on Divorce" 507
Fineman, "Implementing Equality" 511
Mossman, Book Review of Weitzman's Divorce Revolution 517
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to Indian Women 520

b) Pre-Marital Contracts

New York Times, "Prenuptial Stress over the Contract" 521
Wolfson, "The Use and Abuse of Marriage Contracts" from Money and Family Law 523

c) Overview of Equalization of Net Family Property Under the FLA

i) Calculation of the Equalization Payment

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials 526
Skrlj v. Skrlj 539
Folga v. Folga 544
Miller v. Miller 547
Black v. Black 548
Fredricks, "The Ownership Conundrum" 552
Wolfson and Corbin, "Problems of Title and Constructive Trust" 554
Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA 555

ii) Implementation of the Equalization Payment

Humphreys v. Humphreys 556
Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials 562

d) Selected Problems in Determining NFP

i) Valuation and Costs of Disposition

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials 566
Starkman v. Starkman 571
Lawyers Weekly, "Ontario 'debtor-creditor' family law benefits property-owning spouse" 576

ii) Relevance of Constructive Trust

Kelly v. Kelly 578
Rawluk v. Rawluk 580
Note: Applications of Constructive Trust under the FLA (Cox, Hapichuk, Mittler, Heon and McDonald) 607

iii) Pensions

Pask, "Pensions and the Elderly" 610
Note: Pensions and the FLA 612
Humphreys v. Humphreys 613
Note: Proposed Reforms Respecting Pension Division 615
Clarke v. Clarke 616
Veres v. Veres 630
Butt v. Butt 632
Rogers v. Rogers (Lawyers Weekly) 634

iv) Future Interests

Brinkos v. Brinkos 635

v) Educational Degrees, Professional Licenses and other forms of "Human Capital"

Weitzman, "The New Property" in The Divorce Revolution 641
Trebilcock and Keshvani, "A Law and Economics Perspective on the Role of Private Ordering in Family Law" 648
Dulude, Love, Marriage and Money 655
Selick, "Pitfalls in Professional Degree Valuation" 659
Corless v. Corless 660
Caratun v. Caratun 666
Keast v. Keast 679
New York Times, "Her Fame is Ruled His Too: Soprano Must Share Income" 683
Globe and Mail, "Gastineau a loser in Court" 684
Linton v. Linton 685
Chaulk v. Chaulk (Lawyers Weekly) 694
Note: Drummond v. Smith; Ormerod v. Ormerod 695

e) Departures from Equal Sharing

i) Unequal Contributions

Farr v. Farr 696
LeBlanc v. LeBlanc 699
Toronto Star, "A New Day in a Hard Life" 704
Waters v. Waters 705
Sullivan v. Sullivan 709
Berdette v. Berdette 711
Note: Peake; McInnis 717
Wakelin v. Wakelin (Lawyers Weekly) 718

ii) Depletion of Assets; Conduct

Scott v. Scott 719
Note: Cowan 721

iii) Short Marriage; Pre-Marital Property

Murphy v. Murphy 722
Note: Jordan 724
Futia v. Futia (Lawyers Weekly) 725

iv) Post-Separation Needs and other Post-Separation Events

Davies v. Davies 726
Note: Skrlj; McCutcheon; Crane 727

v) Lump Sum Support as Alternative to Unequal Division of NFP

Magee v. Magee 728
MacBride v. MacBride (Lawyers Weekly) 730
Hines v. Hines 731

VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

A. Introduction

a) The Matrimonial Home as a Special Asset

Hovius, "The Matrimonial Home" 734

b) History of Legal Rights in the Matrimonial Home

Hovius, "Possessory Rights in the Matrimonial Home" 735

B. The Matrimonial Home Under the Family Law Act, 1986

a) Overview of Part II of the FLA

Wolfson and Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA" 738
Nurmi v. Nurmi 743

b) Orders for Exclusive Possession

Bissett-Johnson and Holland, Matrimonial Property Law in Canada 747

i) Exclusive Possession or Sale at Trial?

Weitzman, "Disposition of the Family Home" from The Divorce Revolution 749
Rosenthal v. Rosenthal 754
Cicero v. Cicero 756
Note: Review of Case Law 757
Note: Exclusive Possession on the Basis of Emotional Attachment to the Matrimonial Home 758
Note: Alternatives to Exclusive Possessive .. 759

ii) Interim or Temporary Exclusive Possession: Excluding a Spouse from the Matrimonial Home

Pifer v. Pifer 760
Serruys v. Serruys 763
Hill v. Hill 766

c) Groups Precluded from Protection

i) Unmarried Cohabitants

Orlando, "Exclusive Possession of the Family Home: The Plight of Battered Cohabitees" 772
Note: Czora V. Lonergan 774

ii) Native Women

Note: Derrickson v. Derrickson, Paul v. Paul, and Wynn v. Wynn 774

VII. SPOUSAL SUPPORT

A. Historical Origins of Spousal Support

Eekelaar and Maclean, Maintenance After Divorce ... 775

B. Law Reform: Modern Spousal Support Law

Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" 777
LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce 780
Davies, "The Changing Face of Spousal Support Law in Canada" 783
Smart, The Ties that Bind 788
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test" 790

C. Spousal Support Under the Divorce Act, 1985 and the Family Law Act, 1986

a) The Trilogy and the Causal Connection Test

Messier v. Delage 804
Note: The Supreme Court of Canada "Trilogy" 818
Pelech v. Pelech 819
Richardson v. Richardson 837
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test in Spousal Support Law" 851
Note: The Causal Connection Test after the "Trilogy" 856
Winterle v. Winterle 856
Willms v. Willms 857
Madill v. Madill 858
Note: Fisher v. Fisher 862

b) The Self-Sufficiency Principle and Compensation for the Economic Consequences of the Marriage

Dept. of Justice, Evaluation of the Divorce Act ... 863
Rogerson, "Judicial Interpretation of the Spousal and Child Support Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1985" 865
Karlovec v. Karlovec 867
Seward v. Seward 870
Bast v. Bast 872
Heinemann v. Heinemann 873
Story v. Story 879
Moge v. Moge 888
Linton v. Linton 897
Ormerod v. Ormerod 918

c) Illness

Note 937
LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce 937

d) Conduct

Anderson v. Anderson (Lawyers Weekly) 939
MacDonald v. MacDonald (Lawyers Weekly) 940

e) On-going Child Care Responsibilities and Spousal Support

LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce 942
Desmarais v. Desmarais 943
Brockie v. Brockie 945
Thorsteinson v. Thorsteinson 949

Jull v. Jull 951
Fejes v. Fejes 954